


| | |
|---|---|
|  | <p>Annals of Social Sciences and Perspective</p> <p>ISSN (Print): 2707-7063, ISSN (Online): 2788-8797 Volume 5, Number 1, January-June 2024, Pages 169-187 Journal homepage: http://assap.wum.edu.pk/index.php/ojs</p> |
|---|---|

***“Blinds’ Concerns are Always Disregarded”*: Necessity of Revolutionizing English Education for Visually Impaired ELLs**

Rikza Arif¹, Akifa Imtiaz^{2*}

¹ MPhil Scholar/Visiting Lecturer, Department of English, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.

² Associate Professor, Department of English, Fatima Jinnah Women University, Rawalpindi, Pakistan.

*Corresponding Author’s Email Address: akifa.imtiaz@fjwu.edu.pk

| ARTICLE DETAILS | ABSTRACT |
|---|---|
| <p>History: Received: April 24, 2024 Accepted: June 30, 2024</p> <p>Keywords: 21st-century Skills HOTS Visually Impaired ELLs ICT Literacy</p> <p>DOI: 10.52700/assap.v5i1.370</p> | <p>In an era where knowledge is paramount, every student deserves an education that empowers them for academic and professional success, regardless of disability. Focusing on the needs of visually impaired ELLs, this research presents a case study pinpointing gaps in prevailing teaching methods and introduces a revised approach based on 21st-century skills. The study involves four visually impaired fifth-grade students and their English teacher. The school and participants were selected based on the purposive sampling technique. Data was collected with the help of an observation checklist and an observer’s diary. A revised version of Bloom’s Taxonomy by Anderson et al. (2001) was used as a theoretical framework, and the top three levels of the taxonomy, along with the 4Cs and ICT literacy skills, were employed as a methodological framework. The data’s content analysis (Strauss & Corbin, 1990) revealed that the teacher uses a traditional pedagogical approach in the classroom, due to which the students have underdeveloped Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS). Therefore, the methodology was designed to be used by educators to enhance the classroom performance, attitudes, and HOTS of visually impaired students.</p> <p style="text-align: right; font-size: small;">© 2024 The Authors, Published by WUM. This is an Open Access Article under the Creative Common Attribution Non Commercial 4.0</p> |

1. Introduction

Not a single aspect of life is the same anymore as it used to be back in the twentieth century. Because of the considerable advancements in technology, according to Slyter (2019), employers in the 21st-century world are looking for workers who are efficient in terms of cognitive competencies, Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS), and ICT literacy. Industries value individuals who possess these skills and can efficiently practice them in their daily lives. Therefore, the 4Cs, including communication, collaboration, critical thinking, creation; and ICT literacy, are the necessary competencies that are required to learn to survive in a continuously changing world (Stauffer, 2021). Institutes are supposed to teach these skills to students from a young age by practicing 21st century instructional strategies in classrooms (Khan, 2021).

Students of the present world demand a learning environment and pedagogical practices that are supported by 21st-century learning to prosper in the future; nevertheless, in Pakistan, due to chat-and-talk teaching methodology (Afzal, 2019), students - specifically from government schools, are unable to compete with the students of contemporary private schools in their professional lives (Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad, 2009). Most Pakistani government schools are still practising Grammar Translation Method (GTM), (Awan & Shafi, 2016; Liaqat et al., 2021; Safdar, 2013) which is the most outdated and ineffective English language teaching methodology (Panezai and Channa, 2017). Babakhel (2016) says that 98% of students fail Pakistan's competitive exams – which are particularly designed to judge the HOTS – and it is because of their poor English language and 21st-century skills.

Digging deep into the concern, there is a population of students who suffer way more than sighted students in terms of the development of their 21st-century skills in their classrooms, and that is the group of visually impaired learners. It is universally accepted that visually impaired learners have special needs to learn (Rahman, 2019), and they must be provided with the required compensation to provide them with equal opportunities to flourish in their educational and professional careers. Despite this, in Pakistan, they are receiving an education that is not helpful to them in their professional development, and it is due to the teaching practices of their teachers (Khowaja, 2021). Therefore, it is required to develop revised pedagogical strategies for these students to help them effectively gain knowledge and prosper in their professional fields.

The purpose of the present study is to design a teaching methodology based on appropriate 21st-century skills for primary level visually impaired ELLs that could be employed in their classrooms to develop their HOTS. In the present research, a case study has been conducted to secure the right of these students to become productive individuals in their educational and professional fields.

The present research is a significant addition to the field of ELL, as it takes a step forward from the previous literature and contributes to it by providing valuable insights into teaching methodologies for visually impaired students. It is a part of a larger project and has the potential to promote inclusive and effective educational practices for these students. The revised methodology with appropriate 21st-century skills can empower them to develop their higher-level competencies. Moreover, the results of the study can be used by educational policymakers, curriculum designers, and teachers to enhance the learning experiences of ELLs.

The research was conducted to answer the following questions:

- What are the instructional practices of the selected school's English teacher of grade five?
- Which 21st-century skills could be beneficial to developing HOTS in visually impaired ELLs of grade five?

2. Literature Review

The concept of 21st-century skills has been discussed by numerous academics to highlight the importance of the phenomenon in the field of language teaching and learning. To Voogt & Roblin (2012), 21st-century skills are the expertise that is the requirement of a developing society and the needs of youth. According to Stehle & Peters-Burton (2019), 21st-century skills not only help students succeed in all areas of a classroom setting but they are also required for an individual to adjust and flourish in a constantly evolving world.

Significantly, where sighted students are not given appropriate attention towards skill development (Qazi, 2017; Khawaja, 2019), learning scenarios for visually impaired students in Pakistan are more unpleasant (Jahanzaib et al., 2022; Malik et al., 2018; Perveen et al., 2020).

Pakistan is among the few countries where visually impaired learners are excluded from the mainstream education system. According to Jahanzaib et al. (2022), even the English SNC textbooks of primary-level visually impaired students are not in alignment with their learning needs, and according to Perveen et al. (2020), 150 visually impaired students in Rawalpindi are facing learning issues in schools, which is a depiction of the existing exclusivity and need for an effective teaching methodology in Pakistan.

Young learners with visual impairments can and do gain knowledge well, but because they lack easy access to visual learning (National Dissemination Center for Children with Disabilities, 2012), their sense of touch is the primary source (Jackson, 2012). Even though most traditional educational approaches are based on vision as the primary sense (AFB, 2011, cited in Johnson-Jones, 2017), this is not beneficial for these students. According to Malik et al. (2018), the Pakistani educational system still lacks support for them in the required manner and ultimately, it becomes difficult for them to develop their HOTS and progress in the long run.

Precisely in the field of ELL and ELT, the gap in designing inclusive and revised pedagogical methodologies for these students (AFB, 2011, cited in Johnson-Jones, 2017) in Pakistan is prevailing - specifically for young ELLs (Malik et al., 2018). Ali (2020) claims that there is an urgent need to pay considerable attention to bridging this gap by investigating new strategies for middle school level ELLs. According to Ahmed et al. (2011), cited in Malik et al. (2018), if this area of providing inclusive and quality education to visually impaired ELLs remains neglected, it would be very unfair to these students. Hence, the present study serves the best to contribute to the field in light of the identified gap. It provides an inclusive instructional methodology based on appropriate 21st-century skills that can be used to develop the HOTS of primary level visually impaired ELLs and prepare them for their academic and professional development.

3. Methodology

In the present research, qualitative research design is used along with the approach of a case study. We were focused on the issue and then selected one bounded case to demonstrate it. The case of the study is the Government High School for the Blind Girls, Shams Abad, Rawalpindi. The sample of the study includes four visually impaired ELLs in grade five and their English teacher. A purposive sampling strategy is used to select the sample as it allows the selection of people who could possess significant views on the issue under consideration (Robinson, 2013). Tools like an observation checklist and an observer's diary were used to collect data. After collection, it was analyzed using qualitative content analysis (Strauss & Corbin, 1990) technique. As far as the procedure of the research is concerned, the thirty-minute English period was observed daily for six days with the help of the checklist.

During observation, whatever we observed, experienced, and had a chance to know about, we recorded the details in the observer's diary. The results of the analysis were used to design 24 lesson plans for the revised methodology. Each lesson plan is based on two periods - thirty minutes each. The lesson plans were designed based on the first three chapters of the SNC (Single National Curriculum) English textbook for grade five. A revised version of Bloom's Taxonomy by Anderson et al. (2001) was taken as a theoretical framework. The learning objectives that shaped the learning outcomes of the students and assessments of the lessons were designed by keeping the top three levels of the taxonomy in mind. Whereas, classroom activities, teaching practices, and learning strategies revolve around the 4Cs and ICT literacy skills of the 21st century.

4. Analysis, Findings and Discussion

This section presents the results deduced from the classroom observations and the notes from the observer's diary along with a detailed discussion.

4.1. Classroom Observation

In the following table, all the major categories of classroom observation, along with the sub-categories, analysis, and results, are given.

Table 1: Analysis of classroom observation (Authors' compilation)

| S r | Major Categories | Sub- categories | Analysis of classroom observation | | Result |
|--------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|---|---|---|
| | | | Observation | Memo | |
| 1. | Content Organizatio n | Non- hierarchal format | The teacher does not present lessons in a sequence. | The teacher is only concerned about completing the syllabus without focusing on the learning objectives and outcomes given in the textbook. | -There is no scaffolding in the teaching. The teacher presents the content in a disorganized manner. She neither follows the sequence of the English textbook (which is scaffolded from simple to complex) nor relates to new concepts with previously learned knowledge, which causes confusion among the students and they do not get a grasp on any learned concept. -The teacher does not provide meaningful |
| | | | The teacher does not have any goals or objectives designed for the class. | | |
| | | Absence of cross- referencing | The teacher does not relate content to previous or future lessons. | The teacher is more focused on reading the lesson herself and recording it for the students to listen to it in/after school. | |
| | | | The teacher does not summarize the major points of the lessons. | | |

| | | | | | |
|----|------------------------------|--|--|--|--|
| | | Lack of exemplification | The teacher does not give real-life examples to the students to explain complex concepts. | The students are confused at the end of the class about what they have studied and how it is related to them. | examples to the students from their real lives to explain the content of the textbook due to which they feel exclusive to the textbook's content, hence a disconnect can be seen in their knowledge |
| 2. | Pedagogical Practices | Inadequate conceptual explanation | The teacher does not spend sufficient time on making the students understand the major themes of the textbook. | Besides reading, the teacher does not use any non-lecture learning activities to make students understand a concept. | -The pedagogical practices of the teacher are based on traditional teaching techniques, which are not effective for visually impaired students. -She does not use any 21st-century skills or innovative learning activities in her classroom that can develop the HOTS of the students. |
| | | Absence of classroom activities | The teacher does not inculcate any hands-on learning activities in her teaching practices. | The students are solely dependent on verbal explanations that they get in the classroom via the teacher's pre-recorded lectures. | |
| | | Practices of Grammar Translation Method (GTM) | The teacher is focused on translating the whole lesson into Urdu. The teacher does not aim | The students wait for the Urdu translation of lesson(s) reading and commands. | -The teacher does not encourage the students to understand the commands given in small phrases in the target |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|-------------------------------|---|--|--|
| | | | to develop the HOTS of the students. | | language. -She does extensive translation in the students' L1 which does not motivate them to learn/ comprehend English. |
| | | Absence of inclusivity | The teacher does not inculcate diverse strategies for the students and encourages passive learning. | The students are always mentally absent, unbothered, and disinterested in the classroom. Sometimes they do not feel included either because they cannot relate to the concepts they learn from the textbook or because of the non-inclusive approach of the teacher. | -The classroom is non-participatory and students' creativity is discouraged by the teacher. She does not allow the students to speak/ participate/ ask questions in the class. |
| | | | The teacher does not include the students in the lecture, she seems least bothered to see whether they are present in the classroom or not. | | -Moreover, the teaching practices of the teacher lack empathy for the students. |

| | | | | | |
|----|------------------------------|---|--|---|--|
| 3. | Classroom Environment | Monotony | The teacher does not encourage the students to communicate with each other during instructional time in the classroom. | The students are passive recipients of the information. They feel disengaged in the classroom, which affects their overall learning outcomes. | -The classroom environment is unengaging and tedious. There is no active learning. The students do not get a chance to develop their communication and collaborative skills because of low cognitive load and pedagogical inertia. |
| | | Silent classroom culture | They show reluctance and lack of willingness to cooperatively learn in the classroom. | The classroom is dull and lacks excitement, which leads to ineffective learning. | -The teacher does not encourage the students to communicate and collaborate to create an effective learning environment and this hampers their learning. |
| | | Learning in isolation | The teacher does not encourage student-teacher or student-student interaction. | Due to the uncooperative environment in the classroom, the students feel uncomfortable if asked to share their textbooks or any other learning resource with their fellow students. | -There is no culture of conducting classroom discussions or group/pair work. After recording the lesson by reading it aloud, the teacher leaves the class. The students then relisten to the lecture. |
| | | Teacher-induced communication barriers | The students never tell their concerns to the teacher | The students are hesitant to talk to their teacher about having difficulty in learning because | -The teacher |

| | | | | | |
|-----------|-------------------------------------|-------------------------------|---|--|---|
| | | | because of her fear. | they are afraid of her. | ignores the diversity in the classroom and treats the students (low-vision and fully blind) at the same level, which creates unequal learning opportunities for the students. |
| | | | The teacher is fully aware of the students' special needs but does not suggest solutions. | | -Although the teacher knows the needs and learning problems of each student, she overlooks these aspects and does not use alternative strategies to resolve the concerns of the students. |
| | | Ethics | The teacher relies only on formal assessments of the students. | During lectures, the teacher does not value the learning pace of the students. Sometimes, she covers a whole chapter along with unit activities in a class period of thirty minutes, and the students are unable to catch up with her speed. | |
| 4. | Assessment and Reinforcement | Traditional assessment | The teacher assesses the students based on recalling and memorization skills. | The teacher does not use any informal assessment techniques in her classroom to check the understanding | -The assessment and reinforcement techniques of the teacher are not in alignment with 21st-century |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--------------------------------------|---|--|---|
| | | | <p>The teacher uses negative reinforcement techniques in her classroom.</p> | <p>of the students about a concept.</p> <p>The teacher asks the students to listen to recorded lectures and memorize the book activities or Urdu translation of the unit from a tape recorder.</p> | <p>skills; rather, they are based on traditional practices of GTM. The students are being marked on the skill of replicating the textbook's content.</p> <p>-The teacher does not pay attention to whether the students have understood the delivered concept or need additional explanations. She simply focuses on asking the students to memorize recorded information by listening and re-listening to it and translating word-for-word if they want to pass the final examination.</p> <p>-Due to negative reinforcement techniques, the students feel frightened of their teacher and do not dare interact with her during the lecture.</p> |
| | | <p>Negative reinforcement</p> | <p>The students are disconnected and lost in the classroom.</p> | <p>The teacher snubs, punishes, and discourages the students – especially intellectually weak students – when they fail to recall any given information in the classroom.</p> | |

| | | | | | |
|----|--------------------|--|--|---|--|
| 5. | Students' Attitude | Disengaged learners | The students do not ask any questions about a topic. | The pedagogical practices in the classroom make the students lazy, quiet and disengaged. | -There is a lack of interest, motivation, cognitive engagement, and enthusiasm among the students. Despite being a psychologist, the teacher does not boost the level of students' confidence, which causes an inferiority complex among them. They consider themselves incompetent and inefficient in learning and speaking English because of their blindness. (This was confided by them to us during some of our conversations with these students.) |
| | | | The students are highly unmotivated and unconfident in their abilities. | | |
| | | Uncertain and apathetic | The students are not eager to think about any new concept and do not possess a sense of task-completion. | The students do not believe in themselves because of the unsupportive learning environment of the classroom. They have made up their mind that they are not equal to sighted ELLs of their age; therefore, they cannot progress and achieve success in English academics. | |
| | | Negative attitude towards the students | The students avoid learning English and doing activities related to it. They are unwilling to read, write, and speak in the target | The content of the English textbook is delivered to the students in a boring way, because of which they do not feel attracted to and happy with the language. | -The students have a negative attitude towards learning English due to the traditional teaching approach, minimal metacognitive reflection, and absence of |

| | | | | | |
|--|--|--|-----------|--|--|
| | | | language. | | <p>inclusivity.</p> <p>-A tape recorder is a major reason for students' underdeveloped language skills, their lack of interest, their lack of engagement, and their lack of motivation.</p> <p>-Due to the absence of teacher-student interaction, most of the English concepts of the students are uncleaned and ambiguous.</p> |
|--|--|--|-----------|--|--|

From the analysis, it has been determined that the teacher uses an outdated teacher-oriented, GTM-based approach, due to which the students are neither interested in the content of the textbook nor motivated to learn English. Although it is acknowledged that visually impaired learners have diverse learning needs (Farooq, 2012; Maurya, 2016; Rahman, 2019), she practices the Read-Record-Leave (RRL) instructional strategy without scaffolding, actively engaging the students in non-lecture activities, or even explaining complex concepts of the textbook with appropriate examples and clarifications. Notably, existing literature shows that traditional teaching practices are no longer useful in the 21st century, where each student has diverse learning needs. According to McFarlane (2013), the students of the century are not attracted to teacher-centred approaches; rather, they give significant responses to learner-centred teaching methodologies. It has been studied that the teacher neither inculcates differentiation in her pedagogy nor ensures inclusivity in the classroom. The findings draw attention to the fact that the learning experiences of visually impaired students in grade five are being affected because of the absence of an appropriate pedagogical methodology in the classroom (c.f. Table 1). Kızılaslan (2020) claims that the modern teaching strategies of the 21st century are designed for normal-sighted students and overlook the requirements of these students; therefore, there is a need for a revised approach. In line with this, the present study presents a methodology with appropriate 21st-century skills for visually impaired ELLs at the primary level to promote the concepts of equality, diversity, and inclusiveness regardless of disability.

4.2. Analysis of Notes from the Observer’s Diary

The analysis of the data from the observer’s diary provided us with significant insights into the learning competencies of the students and their classroom challenges, which we used while designing sample lesson plans for the revised methodology.

4.2.1. English Language Teacher's Attitude

The attitude of the teacher concerning the students was observed, and it is further categorized as follows:

(i) Lack of Responsiveness

The analysis of the data reveals that the teacher lacks responsiveness towards the students. She arrives late and leaves the class before the period ends. In the limited period of teaching, the teacher remains focused on reading the lesson and recording it on a tape recorder. It has been observed multiple times that when any of the students from the class informs the teacher that she does not have the English textbook, the teacher snubs and says, **“Do not tell me the same thing every day. I am recording the lecture. You can listen to it from here later”** (c.f. Table 1 (2) Absence of Inclusivity).

(ii) HOTS Development

The observations are filled with data that portrays that there is no classroom culture of developing HOTS in the students. It has been observed that the teacher is intended to sharpen the skills of recall and memorization of the students. After the end of class, she says, **“Listen to the recording of today's class together and memorize it”** (c.f. Table 1 (2) Practices of GTM). Interestingly, it has also been observed that the teacher omits those activities from the textbook that could play a role in the development of the higher-order skills of the students. The only book activities that the teacher records for the students are questions/ answers, fill-in-the-blanks, words/ meaning, and specific parts of grammar (c.f. Table 1 (2) Pedagogical Practices).

(iii) Non-Flexibility

The data shows that the teacher is not aware of executing substitute circumstances to create a meaningful learning environment for the students. Sometimes, when the students do not respond to her everyday **“Have you understood?”** question, which she usually asks after recording the lecture, she blames them for their carelessness despite being flexible enough to adopt a strategy that could deal with the reluctance of the students. The analysis describes that the teacher disregards the introspection of her teaching methodology. She is not flexible enough to reflect on her instructional methodology to come up with new and advanced techniques that can promote personalized learning experiences for the students.

(iv) Clarity

In the textbook, there is a progression from simple to complex concepts, and the teacher is not following this sequence, which makes learning more difficult and ambiguous for the students. On top of that, an incident was observed during the observation when the teacher missed the class and asked the students to listen to any of the previous lectures on the recorder. The students started listening to a lesson that covered the concept of an ink pen and its uses. The class listened to it for two minutes, and then Student-4 turned the recorder off by saying, **“What are we supposed to do with an ink pen? It is boring. Play something else.”** Student-1 said, **“I have never touched an ink pen. How do I know about its uses?”** (c.f. Table 1 (1) Lack of Exemplification).

4.2.2. Physical and Learning Environment

The category of physical and learning environment covers the themes of uninspiring ambience and ELL anxiety.

(i) Uninspiring Ambiance

The data from the observer's diary show that the students do not do any physical movement during the class. They stay seated on their chairs the whole period, due to which they often get to sleep in the same position, and the teacher learns about it after the tape recorder turns off.

Additionally, it has been noted that there is a sports period for the students daily in the last class, which is always unattended. In that class, the students mostly pack their bags and wait to go back to the boarding, eat their lunch, or look for students who could help them learn Urdu contractions.

(ii) ELL Anxiety

An incident from the observer's diary is a vivid explanation of the students' anxiety. During observation, when the English teacher was late, the science teacher came in to ask the students about the language in which they wanted to study the subject. Student-2 instantly replied, **"In Urdu. We will fail the subject if we study it in English,"** Student-1 said, **"English makes me burdened"**, and Student-4 replied, **"I do not understand concepts in English."** When the teacher left, Student-1 added, **"I wish all the English subjects would be in Urdu."** Following the conversation, Student-2 left the class uttering, **"Do not waste your energy. Our (blinds') concerns are always disregarded."** The incident witnesses the students' silent protest of being unheard about their ELL concerns in the classroom, along with revealing their dispassionate attitude towards language learning (c.f. Table 1 (5) Negative Attitude towards ELL).

4.2.3. Students' Competencies

This category covers the themes of the foundational skill gap and self-efficacy deficit.

(i) Foundational Skill Gap

The students lack English literacy skills and struggle a lot with their English textbook content. They glitch while reading, make spelling errors in writing the language, and get stuck when it comes to understanding the textbook content or any guideline that comes from their teacher's side. Moreover, the skills of analyzing and evaluating information or a situation are also absent among the students. They waste a lot of time decoding the basic guidelines of their teacher. They get panicky, lost, or frightened whenever they find themselves in a situation in which they are asked to use their brain, specify relevant information, make decisions, and perform an action. As far as their digital literacy skills are concerned, they do not know anything about information technology. They are scared of cell phones and feel uncomfortable in the computer lab. In their study on visually impaired students, Aasi, Imtiaz, and Shahzad (2023) revealed that "visually impaired students continuously tried to maintain social distance from their teacher inside the classroom and usually remained silent or gave short responses." One of the reasons for this could be their weak creative skills.

(ii) Self-Efficacy Deficit

It has been observed that the students underestimate their competencies and possess a fear of failure. In one of the episodes, a teacher came in and asked the students if any of them were interested in participating in a sports competition. Student-3 answered, **"No, ma'am. We will go back to the boarding."** Without even listening to the responses of the other three students, she went out as if she already knew the answers. After she left, Students 1 and 4 said, **"I cannot play any game. I always mess up,"** and **"I feel all eyes judging me and it makes me anxious. I also cannot do that,"** respectively.

4.2.4. Limitations and Impediments

The analysis of the category deals with the issues or challenges faced by the teacher and the students in ELL.

(i) Low-resourced

Sadly, the teacher does not have English textbooks in Braille, a Perkins Braille device, supplementary teaching resources, or workbooks to effectively teach the students. It was observed that there is an absence of personal tape recorders, styluses, and frames. The teacher

does not even have papers (for braille writing) to give to the students to note down lectures. Whenever they ask their teacher for papers to write, she responds, “**School does not have funds to buy you papers. Ask your parents for this.**” Moreover, the classroom does not have any specialized technology to inspire sensory exploration in the students.

(ii) Grade Retention, Promotion, and Age Inappropriateness

Retention, promotion, and age inappropriateness are the common impediments in the classroom. It has been studied that due to the inadequate pedagogical practices of the teacher (c.f. Table 1 (2) Pedagogical Practices), the students fail their final examination, which causes them to spend an additional year(s) in the same class and get over-aged. Besides, enrolling mature students in kindergarten and then promoting them to senior classes is also an everyday situation. Students sit for five days in the promoted classroom, and if any senior teacher does not accept the promotion, they get demoted to the previous class again.

In the analysis, students’ incompetence, classroom challenges, and exclusivity issues have been studied, which are caused by the traditional teaching approach of the teacher. It highlights the significance of incorporating those 21st-century skills into a new methodology that would be parallel to the needs of the students and appropriate to their cognitive capability; therefore, Learning and Innovation Skills (4Cs) along with appropriate ICT literacy were decided to be advantageous to developing their HOTS and increasing their learning capacity. Before the present study, multiple studies have used the 4Cs and/or ICT literacy with sighted students to improve their learning experiences and enhance the effect of teaching practices in the classroom, for instance, Afzal (2019) and Wahid et al. (2021). Significantly, while designing lessons, the classroom activities were planned under these skills, keeping the requirements of the students in mind. The complexity level of the activities was gradually increased to avoid stressing the students and losing their interest at the beginning.

4.3. Sample Lesson Plan

A lesson plan is presented below as a reference to the other 23 lesson plans designed. Similar to the other 23 lesson plans, this lesson plan-2 is also prepared for 2 periods (i.e., total 60 minutes’ duration). It is based on the pre-reading activities on “Unit 1: Patience”, from the English textbook of the students. The breakdown of the lesson plan is given below:

Table 2: Breakdown of Lesson plan-2 (Authors’ compilation)

| | | |
|--------------------------|---|-----------------|
| Lesson Plan: 2 | Title: Pre-Reading Activities of Unit 01: Patience | |
| No. of Periods: 2 | Time: 30 minutes each | Class: 5 |
| Lesson Objective | To enable the students to relate their prior knowledge with the new text, and make ground for them to develop their analytical skills by deconstructing the given information into smaller pieces and drawing conclusions. | |
| Learning Outcomes | It was intended to make the students able to: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Use pre-reading strategies to predict the content of a text from a topic, title, headings(s), or a described picture, with the help of prior knowledge. ● Use critical thinking to apply world knowledge and their own opinion to the text. ● Relate their own feelings and experiences to what is read or listened to. | |

| | |
|---|--|
| <p>Instruction for the teacher</p> | <p>We planned the following guidelines to stay focused and stick with the lesson objectives.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The teacher will motivate the students to share their thoughts about the ethics and values of society, which are the major themes of Unit 1. ● Students will be encouraged to answer critical questions after listening to a short story on the teacher’s phone. ● The teacher will allow students to develop their stance on the basis of their existing knowledge by using critical thinking. |
| <p>Material/Resource</p> | <p>The English textbook and the short story “Kids Moral Story on Patience - Ramadan Stories for Kids” from YouTube on the mobile phone</p> |
| <p>Introduction</p> | <p>The following introduction was planned for the students to develop their interest and attentiveness in the classroom.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Recall the given concept of patience and tell the students that the content of a text can be predicted from the title of the topic, pictures, or headings. ● Describe some pictures and tell a few titles to the students from the resource book and ask them to guess the lesson's content. |
| <p>Activities</p> | <p>The following pair/ group, communication, and classroom discussion activities were designed for the students for each day.</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Day 1</p> <p>Activity 1: Predict the story</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● Divide students into pairs. ● Describe pictures (or tell a few titles) to each pair from the textbook and ask them to predict the story after listening to the details of the picture (or the title). ● Encourage the students to share their ideas with the class. <p style="text-align: center;">Day 2</p> <p>Activity 1: What do you think?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The teacher will play the ethical short story: “Kids Moral Story on Patience - Ramadan Stories for Kids” from YouTube on her mobile phone and ask the students to listen to it carefully and try to note down what they think is important information about “patience”. ● After the story, the teacher will conduct a classroom discussion in which the students will be motivated to talk about the following: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Important points/ moral of the story. 2. Ethics and moral values (major themes of Unit 1). 3. Relate your personal experiences or opinions to the moral of the story. <p>Activity 2: Pre-reading questions of Unit 1</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ● The teacher will ask the following pre-reading questions of Unit 1 from the textbook to each student: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Why are moral values important to us? 2. Have you ever faced any situation in which you showed |

| | |
|-------------------------------|---|
| | <p>patience?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • The teacher will also ask the following additional question: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 3. If you were at Yahiya's place, what would be your reaction? |
| Conclusion/ Sum up | In the end, classes will be wrapped up with a recap of all the major concepts discussed in the lesson. The students will be told that they will read Unit 1, 'Patience' in the next class. |

In this way, all the lessons are planned to target the HOTS of the students and practice activities revolving around the 4Cs and ICT.

5. Conclusion

The present research was conducted to foreground the instructional practices of the English teacher of visually impaired ELLs in grade five and design a teaching methodology that is appropriate and advantageous to develop the HOTS of these students. The findings of the study revealed that the teacher practices an outdated teaching approach in the classroom and does not target the HOTS of the students. It has also been studied that the students are unmotivated towards ELL because of the teacher-centred classroom approach. Therefore, an updated methodology has been introduced based on the 4Cs and ICT literacy of 21st-century skills to revolutionize English education for these students. This methodology can serve as a tool for nurturing HOTS in young, visually impaired ELLs through tailored techniques and carefully calibrated levels of complexity. In addition, concerning the findings, it is suggested that curriculum designers keep in mind the elements of inclusivity and corresponding education for all students while designing the content of English textbooks to promote a culture of equal educational opportunities for all students in Pakistan. Also, educational institutes, NGOs, and special education departments consider the special needs of these students and improve the availability of necessary classroom learning resources to contribute to an inclusive educational environment.

References

- Aasi, F. S., Imtiaz, A., & Shahzad, A. K. (2023). Politeness in the Classrooms of the Visually Impaired Students: A Case Study. *Global Educational Studies Review*, VIII(II), 64-78. [https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023\(VIII-II\).07](https://doi.org/10.31703/gesr.2023(VIII-II).07)
- AFB. (2011). *Educating students with visual impairments for inclusion society*. American Foundation for the Blind.
- Afzal, A. (2019). *Effect of the Technology-Supported Learning on the Academic Performance of Secondary School Students* [PhD dissertation]. Iqra University.
- Ahmed, M., Khan, A. B., & Nasem, F. (2011). Policies for Special Persons in Pakistan Analysis of Policy Implementation. *Berkeley Journal of Social Sciences*, 1(2).
- Ali, A. M. (2020). Implementing Action Research in EFL/ESL Classrooms: a Systematic Review of Literature 2010–2019. *Systemic Practice and Action Research*. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11213-020-09523-y>
- Anderson, L. W., & Krathwohl, D. R. (2001). *A Taxonomy for Learning, Teaching, and Assessing: A Revision of Bloom's Taxonomy of Educational Objectives*. Pearson.
- Awan, A. G. A., & Shafi, M. S. (2016). Analysis of Teaching Methods of English Language at Government Secondary School Level in D.G. Khan City- Pakistan. *Global Journal of Management and Social Sciences*, 2(2). <https://shorturl.at/dVeSn>

- Babakhel, M. B. (2016, November 25). *Discussing the 98 per cent failure in the CSS exams*. The Express Tribune. <https://tribune.com.pk/story/1243430/discussing-98-per-cent-failure-css-exams>
- Farooq, M. S. F. (2012). Problems faced by students with special needs in ordinary Pakistani schools. *Journal of Quality and Technology Management*, 8(1), 13–27.
- Higher Education System Strengthening Activity. (2022). Class Observation Feedback Report Form. In *Higher Education System Strengthening Activity (HESSA)*.
Identify the topic sentence. (2015). Reading Worksheets, Spelling, Grammar, Comprehension, Lesson Plans. <https://www.k12reader.com/worksheet/identify-the-topic-sentence/>
- Jackson, R. M. J. (2012). Audio-Supported Reading for Students Who Are Blind or Visually Impaired. *National Center on Accessible Educational Materials*. <https://aem.cast.org/binaries/content/assets/common/publications/aem/asr-blind-visuallyimpaired.pdf>
- Jahanzaib, M., Fatima, G., & Nayab, D. E. (2022). Review of Primary Level Curriculum for Children with Visual Impairment formulated by Punjab Curriculum and Textbook Board, Lahore-Pakistan. *Journal of Business and Social Review in Emerging Economies*, 8(1). <https://doi.org/10.26710/jbsee.v8i1.2155>
- Johnson-Jones, K. J. (2017). Educating Students with Visual Impairments in the General Education Setting. *ProQuest LLC eBooks*. <https://aquila.usm.edu/cgi/viewcontent.cgi?article=2328&context=dissertations>
- Khan, H. K. (2021). *Implementation of 21st Century Skills: A Case Study of Higher Education in Pakistan* [PhD dissertation]. INTERNATIONAL ISLAMIC UNIVERSITY ISLAMABAD.
- Khawaja, N. U. A. (2019, December 1). Rigid education system as a killer of creativity. *The Nation*. <https://www.nation.com.pk/02-Dec-2019/rigid-education-system-as-a-killer-of-creativity>
- Khowaja, S. K. (Ed.). (2021). *Visual Impairment and Tertiary Education in Karachi*. 4th International Academic Conference on Education. <https://www.dpublication.com/wp-content/uploads/2021/12/41-54000.pdf>
- Kızılaslan, A. K. (2020). *Teaching Students with Visual Impairments*. *Progress in Education*, 978-1-53617-166-2. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/341000567_Teaching_students_with_visual_impairment
- Liaqat, A. L., Naseem, U. M., & Rubbani, A. R. (2021). Effectiveness of GTM and DM in sialkot schools: A comparative study. *Webology*, 18(6). <https://shorturl.at/u0H7N>
- Live Work Sheets. (2020). *Interactive worksheets maker for all languages and subjects*. Liveworksheets. <https://www.liveworksheets.com/w/en/english-language-arts-ela/417057>
- Malik, S., Manaf, U. K. A., Ahmad, N. A., & Ismail, M. (2018). Investigating Special Education Curriculum for Visually Impaired Children in Solving Family Adjustment Issues in Pakistan. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business & Social Sciences*, 7(14). <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v7-i14/3678>
- Maurya, H. K. M. (2016). Strategies for Teaching Students with Visual Impairment. *All International Multidisciplinary Refereed Research Journal*. https://www.researchgate.net/publication/353013224_Strategies_for_Teaching_Students_with_Visual_Impairment
- McFarlane, D. A. (2013). Understanding the Challenges of Science Education in the

- 21st Century: New Opportunities for Scientific Literacy. *International Letters of Social and Humanistic Sciences*, 4, 35–44. <https://doi.org/10.18052/www.scipress.com/ilshs.4.35>
- Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan, Islamabad. (2009, November). National Education Policy. International Institute for Educational Planning-UNESCO. Government of Pakistan. Retrieved from https://planipolis.iiep.unesco.org/sites/default/files/ressources/pakistan_national_education_policy_2009.pdf
- National Dissemination Center for Children with Disabilities. (2012, November). Visual Impairments, including Blindness. Retrieved from https://www.parentcenterhub.org/wp-content/uploads/repo_items/fs13.pdf
- Panezai, S. G., & Channa, L. A. (2017). Pakistani government primary school teachers and the English textbooks of Grades 1–5: A mixed methods teachers' led evaluation. *Cogent Education*, 4(1), 1269712. <https://doi.org/10.1080/2331186x.2016.1269712>
- Perveen, N., Yousuf, M. I., & Ajaib, A. (2020). Learning Opportunities and Challenges Faced by Visually Impaired Students in Special Schools of District Rawalpindi. *Pakistan Social Sciences Review*, 4(2), 978–985. [https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2020\(4-ii\)78](https://doi.org/10.35484/pssr.2020(4-ii)78)
- Qazi, N. A. (2017, December 22). Do our schools actually kill creativity? *Daily Pakistan Global*. <https://en.dailypakistan.com.pk/22-Dec-2017/do-our-schools-actually-kill-creativity>
- Rahman, A. R. (2019). Education Setting for Visually Impaired Students: A Review. *International Journal of Advance Research and Innovative Ideas in Education*, 5(5). http://ijariie.com/AdminUploadPdf/Education_Setting_for_Visually_Impaired_Students_A_Review_ijariie10902.pdf
- Robinson, O. (2013). Sampling in Interview-Based Qualitative Research: A Theoretical and Practical Guide. *Qualitative Research in Psychology*, 11(1), 25–41. <https://doi.org/10.1080/14780887.2013.801543>
- Robinson, S. K. R. (2011). Do schools kill creativity? TED conference. Retrieved from https://www.ted.com/talks/sir_ken_robinson_do_schools_kill_creativity
<https://shorturl.at/IUU4b>
- Safdar, A. S. (2013). *Effectiveness of Information And Communication Technology (ICT) In Mathematics At Secondary Level* [PhD Thesis]. International Islamic University Islamabad.
- Slyter, K. S. (2019, December 16). *Do You Have the 21st Century Skills Today's Employers Are Seeking?* Rasmussen University. <https://www.rasmussen.edu/student-experience/college-life/21st-century-skills/>
- Stauffer, B. (2021, December 31). *What Are the 4 C's of 21st Century Skills?* Applied-Educational-Systems. Retrieved February 9, 2023, from <https://www.aeseducation.com/blog/four-cs-21st-century-skills>
- Stehle, S. M., & Peters-Burton, E. E. (2019). Developing student 21st Century skills in selected exemplary inclusive STEM high schools. *International Journal of STEM Education*, 6(1). <https://doi.org/10.1186/s40594-019-0192-1>
- Strauss, A., & Corbin, J. M. (1990). Basics of qualitative research: Grounded theory procedures and techniques. Sage Publications, Inc.
- Universitas Islam Indonesia. (2019). *English Language Education Study Program*. <https://pbi.uui.ac.id/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/OBSERVATION-CHECKLIST.pdf>
- University of Nebraska–Lincoln. (2004, May 13). *Classroom Observation Checklist*.

- https://www.unl.edu/gradstudies/current/teaching/Classroom_Observation_Form.pdf/
Voogt, J., & Roblin, N. P. (2012). A comparative analysis of international frameworks for 21st century competences: Implications for national curriculum policies. *Journal of Curriculum Studies*, 44(3), 299–321. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2012.668938>
- Wahid, A., Ahmad, M., & Pataufi. (2021). Character-based 4C Learning Model to Improving Students' Metacognitive Abilities: A Develop Phase of Research & Development. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, 9(3), 650–659. <https://doi.org/10.13189/ujer.2021.090324>